

## Lesson 12

### DATIVE CASE

#### Formation:

Formally the Pali dative largely coincides with the genitive. Where the form is ambiguous the case may generally be known from relating either to another noun (genitive) or to the verb forms (dative).

nominative	dative
<i>piṇḍo</i>	<i>piṇḍāya</i> or <i>piṇḍassa</i>
<i>nibbānaṃ</i>	<i>nibbānāya</i> or <i>nibbānassa</i>

The only exception is that, for masculine and neuter nouns in *-a*, the dative singular can be *-āya* as well as *-assa*.

The overlap between the dative and genitive means that our noun tables look the same as in §11.2, except that masculine nouns in *-a* have the dative singular ending *-āya* as well as *-assa*.

	Masculine		Neuter	
	Singular	Plural	Singular	Plural
Nominative	<i>dhammo</i>	<i>dhammā</i>	<i>yānaṃ</i>	<i>yānāni</i>
Accusative	<i>dhammaṃ</i>	<i>dhamme</i>	<i>yānaṃ</i>	<i>yānāni</i>
Instrumental	<i>dhammena</i>	<i>dhammehi</i>	<i>yānena</i>	<i>yānehi</i>
Genitive	<i>dhammassa</i>	<i>dhammānaṃ</i>	<i>yānassa</i>	<i>yānānaṃ</i>
Dative	<i>dhammassa</i> or <i>dhammāya</i>	<i>dhammānaṃ</i>	<i>yānassa</i> or <i>yānāya</i>	<i>yānānaṃ</i>
Vocative	<i>dhamma</i>	<i>dhammā</i>	<i>yāna</i>	<i>yānāni</i>

#### Usage:

##### A. Indirect Object

The dative case is used to express the purpose for which an action is done and the person to whom something is given (indirect object). **The dative is often found when verbs of giving are used**; indeed, the word dative itself comes from the Latin dare 'to give'. For example:

He gave a slave **to the brahmin**.  
= *dāsaṃ brāhmaṇassa adāsi* / *dāsaṃ brāhmaṇāya adāsi*

The dative may express the person for whom something is done or to whom something which happens is advantageous (dative of advantage). It is used also with a number of individual verbs (see below).

## B. Purpose

When it expresses purpose, it is the dative ending in *-āya* (rather than *-assa*) that is usually employed for nouns in *-a*. In other contexts, the ending *-assa* tends to be used. In fact, the 'pure' dative form in *-āya* is normally only ever found in the context of purpose.

*gāmaṃ piṇḍāya pāvīsi*  
= he entered the village for alms.

*mayam Gotamaṃ dāssanāya upasaṃkantā.*  
= We have come in order to see Gotama (literally, 'for seeing Gotama').

## C. Other dative usages

- An important group of verbs in Pali takes the dative as a direct object. Warder lists them on pp.67-8.
- Verb *(k)kham* meaning "to please" (someone = dative)
  - *me khamati* = It pleases me.
- Verb *(k)kham* meaning "to forgive" (someone = dative, something = accusative)
- Verb *(p)paṭi-(s)su* meaning "to assent to (someone)" takes the dative. (For the aorist of  $\sqrt{su}$ , see §13/14.3 below.) For example:
  - *Ānando bhagavato paccassosi* = Ānanda agreed with the Blessed One.
- Verb *upa-(t)thā*, meaning to serve, attend on/to someone or something (dative)
- Verb *dhar* in the sense of "hold for/over" takes the dative of the person sheltered, and in the sense of "owe", it takes the dative of the person to whom something is owed.
- Verb *ā-ruc* ("to inform") takes the dative of the person informed (whereas *ā-mant* takes the accusative).
- Verbs meaning to be angry at (*kup*, etc.), to curse (*sap*), to long for (*pih*), and to be clear to (*(p)pa-(k)khā*: visible, apparent), to appear to (*(pātu(r))-bhū*: manifest) take the dative.
- 'For the sake of' (= dative of purpose, above) is expressed by *atthāya* preceded by the genitive of the person or object of the endeavour:
  - X in the genitive + *atthāya* = 'for the sake of X'
  - *dhanass' atthāya* = for the sake of wealth
- Adjective (of verbal import) '*piya* = dear' takes the dative of the person to whom.
- *Piya* + dative = 'dear to...'.
  - *piyo me rājā* = The king is dear to me.

- *Namo* + dative = 'homage to...' (for an example, see §13/14.8)
- A very important idiomatic construction with the dative case refers to the proper time for something, the opportunity for something.
  - *etassa kālo* = it is the time for this' / 'it is the right time for this'
  - *akālo ...yācanāya* = it is not the right time for asking
  - *yassa dāni kālaṃ maññasi*
  - = literally: for which you think it is now (*dāni*) the right time".
  - *Kālo* + dative = 'the time for...'
  - *na dāni te tuṇhībhāvassa kālo*
  - = Now is not the time for you to be silent.
  - (Literally: 'Now is not the time for your silence.' *tuṇhībhāva n.* = silence.)
- The indeclinable *alaṃ* ("sufficient", "enough", "adequate", "perfected") takes the dative. Besides the ordinary sense of "sufficient" (for any purpose), it has the idiomatic meaning of a refusal or objection ("enough!" = "stop!", "I won't!", etc.) with dative of the person for whom it is sufficient or superfluous:
  - I won't = *alaṃ me*
  - it is sufficient for you = *alaṃ vo*
- The negative participle *abhabba*, which functions as an adjective meaning "unable", "incapable", takes the dative of the action which cannot be done, if the latter is expressed by a noun ("action noun").
- When wishes (good wishes) are expressed, the dative is used for the person for whom they are expressed:
  - May there be (*hotu*) = long life for him
  - Good luck to you = *bhaddaṃ bhavato hotu*
  - Welcome to you = *svāgataṃ bhavato hotu* (
- Like *svāgataṃ* = 'welcome!', the indeclinables: *sotthi* (= safety / safely) and *namo* (= hail!) take the dative.
- The following expression is extremely common in saying (formally) goodbye (spoken by the host, not the guest - who for his part has made the excuse of pressure of work). It is used also by servants reporting to their master that preparations are completed, implying "you can start whenever you wish", etc.
  - *yassa dāni kālaṃ maññasi*
  - = literally: for which you think it is now (*dāni*) the right time.

## Aorist of (s)su

Aorist of the verb  $\sqrt{su}$  = hear

	<b>singular</b>	<b>plural</b>
<b>3rd person</b>	<i>assosi</i> = he heard	<i>assosum</i>
<b>2nd person</b>	<i>assosi</i>	<i>assuttha</i>
<b>1st person</b>	<i>assosiṃ</i>	<i>assumha</i>

## RELATIVE CLAUSES

### English vs Pali on Embedding

Relative clauses precede or go after their main clause rather than being embedded in the main clause (as in English). According to Warder, the usual order is for relative clauses to precede their main clause.

English tends to embed relative clauses within the main clause. For instance: In the sentence: 'The man who arrived yesterday is strange', the relative clause 'who arrived yesterday' is embedded within the main clause 'the man is strange'.

Pali separates out the relative clause and the main clause. Pali would express the above sentences thus:

- English: 'The man who arrived yesterday is strange.'  
Pali: 'Which man arrived yesterday, he is strange.'
- English: 'Boys who hit girls are bad.'  
Pali: 'Which boys hit girls, they are bad.'
- English: 'The book which I bought is fascinating.'  
Pali: 'Which book I bought, that is fascinating.'
- English: 'The brahmin to whom I gave a gift is called Jotipāla.'  
Pali: 'To which brahmin I gave a gift, he is called Jotipāla.'

Note how, in Pali, the antecedents 'man', 'boys', 'book', and 'brahmin' are found in the relative clause and not in the main clause: 'which man...', 'which boys...', 'which book...', 'to which brahmin...'

*yo rājā bhagavantaṃ addasā, so Brahadatto ti vuccati.*

= Literally = Which king saw the Blessed One, he is called Brahadatta.

*yaṃ purisaṃ addasaṃ so Jotipālo ti vuccati.*

= Which man I saw, he is called Jotipāla.'

= The man whom I saw is called Jotipāla.'

Here the antecedent ('king') is in the relative clause: 'which king...' In English, however, we would state: 'The king who saw the Blessed One is called Brahadatta.'

However, although in Pali the antecedent is found in the relative clause if it is a noun, the antecedent is not found in the relative clause if it is a pronoun.

The sentence 'Those who approached saw the Blessed One': the antecedent ('those') is a pronoun and, in Pali, it will stay in the main clause, with the whole sentence being expressed thus:

Those who approached saw the Blessed One

-> Who approached, those saw the Blessed One.

= ye [zero] upasaṃkamaṃsu, te bhagavantaṃ addasaṃsu

Another very striking aspect about the relative construction in Pali is the way in which the **relative pronoun is often 'picked up' by a pronoun in the main clause**. Thus:

'Which man arrived yesterday, **he** is strange.'

'Which boys hit girls, **they** are bad.'

'Which book I bought, **that** is fascinating.'

'To which brahmin I gave a gift, **he** is called Jotipāla.'

'Who approached, **they** saw the Blessed One.'

*ye bhagavantam passanti, te na paridevanti.*

= Literally: Who see the Blessed One, **they** do not lament.

*yam aniccaṃ taṃ dukkhaṃ.*

= Literally: 'What is impermanent, that is painful.'

In such contexts, the pronoun in the main clause (te and taṃ in the above examples) is called a co-relative because of the way in which it connects with the relative pronoun. This pattern of **relative followed by co-relative** is important to remember as it serves to **mark out the subordinate and main clauses to the reader** (although Pali sometimes misses out the co-relative).

Note:

1. English often omits relative pronouns. For example: 'the book I bought is fascinating'. In Pali, on the other hand, **the relative pronoun ('the book which I bought') has to be expressed**. That said, Pali has ways of getting around relative clauses such as the use of compounds (which will be discussed in the next chapter of Warder).

2. Sometimes the relative clause goes after the main clause. In this case, the sentence 'The man whom I saw is called Jotipāla' would be expressed thus:

*puriso Jotipālo ti vuccati **yam addasaṃ**.*

Literally = The man is called Jotipāla whom I saw.

*brāhmaṇo gāmaṃ gacchati **yassa tvaṃ piṇḍaṃ adāsi**.*

Literally = The brahmin is going to the village to whom you gave alms.

Note that for this construction the **antecedent** ('man' and 'brahmin' respectively) **is not found in the relative clause**.

3. It is often useful to be very literal when first translating a Pali relative clause, so that one can analyse its various parts and then come up with a more natural English translation. For example, take the following Pali sentence:

*yassa brāhmaṇassa tvaṃ piṇḍaṃ adāsi so gāmaṃ gacchati.*

Literally = To which brahmin you gave alms, he is going to the village.

Better English = The brahmin to whom you gave alms is going to the village.

## Relative Pronoun

The relative pronoun has the stem *ya(d)*, "who", "which" - which is inflected in the three genders in the same way as the demonstrative *so, sā, taṃ*, or *tad*:

	singular			plural		
	masculine	neuter	feminine	masculine	neuter	feminine
<b>nominative</b>	<i>yo</i>	<i>yaṃ</i> or <i>yad</i>	<i>yā</i>	<i>ye</i>	<i>yāni</i>	<i>yā</i>
<b>accusative</b>	<i>yaṃ</i>	<i>yaṃ</i> or <i>yad</i>	<i>yaṃ</i>			
<b>instrumental</b>	<i>yena</i>		<i>yāya</i>	<i>yehi</i>		<i>yāhi</i>
<b>dative</b>	<i>yassa</i>		<i>yassā</i>	<i>yesaṃ</i>		<i>yāsaṃ</i>
<b>genitive</b>						

Relative pronouns are used mostly in relative clauses, but some of the case-forms are also used as indeclinables.

## Relative Clauses

The relative clause is the regular form of subordinate clause in Pali.

Its use is frequent. The clear articulation of the sentence into a **subordinate clause introduced by a relative word** (a pronoun or an indeclinable such as *yattha*, "where") and a **main clause introduced by a demonstrative word** is an outstanding characteristic of Pali.

Complex sentences or "periods" may be built up by combinations of relative clauses and demonstrative clauses, co-ordinate clauses (joined by conjunctive particles such as *ca*), direct speech and so forth.

The relative clause regularly precedes the main clause. The relative word introduces the clause, but may be preceded by **indeclinables connecting the whole sentence** to the narrative of which it forms a part. e.g.:

*atha kho ye icchimsu te akaṃsu*  
 = then (indeed) those who wished, worked  
 Literally = ... who wished, they worked

## Agreement

**Relative pronouns follow the same gender and number** as the word to which they are related in the main clause. **Their case, however, is determined by their function in their subordinate clause.** For example:

'They ask the king who is lying down'.  
 Pali would state: 'Which king is lying down, him they ask.'  
 = *yo rājā nipajjati taṃ* *pucchanti*.

Here *yo* has the same gender and number as *taṃ* in the main clause; i.e. it is masculine and singular. However, *yo* is in the **nominative case because it is the subject of the subordinate clause**, whereas *taṃ* is in the **accusative case because it is the object of the main clause**.

*yena dvārena nikkhami taṃ* *Gotamadvāraṃ nāma ahoṣi*

= The gate by which he left was called Gotama Gate  
[by which (instrumental) gate he left, that (nominative) Gotama Gate named was]

## Correlatives

Besides the demonstrative, other pronouns may serve as correlatives\*, e.g., the personal pronouns and also the "pronominal adjective" (see below) *sabba* (= all):

\*Two words that are correlative are often used together but not usually used next to each other. For example, 'either' and 'or' are correlative conjunctions" -- Macmillan Dictionary.

*ye ... ahesuṃ, ... sabbe ... bhakkhesi*

= those ... who were there, ... he devoured (*bhakkh*) them all."

Repetition of a relative word emphasises that the clause is universal: *yo yo* = "whoever". The correlative also is repeated. e.g.:

*yo yo ... ādiyissati tassa tassa ... anuppadassāmi*

= whoever will take ... to him I will grant ...

A demonstrative pronoun immediately following a relative pronoun is emphatic: *yo so* = "he who", "that which"

*yo so satto paṭhamam\* upapanno, tassa evaṃ hoti: ahaṃ asmi brahmā*

Literally = Who that being first is reborn, has this thought: I am God.

= that being who has come into existence first (in the evolution of the universe) thinks he is God.

\* *paṭhamam* here is an indeclinable meaning 'first' / 'firstly'. It is derived from the ordinal numeral *paṭhama* (= first पञ्चम).

## Relative Indeclinables

Relative indeclinables include words such as 'where' and 'when'. They do not inflect. We have already come across such words in the *yena...tena...* construction ('where...there...'), in which *yena* is a relative indeclinable that connects with the correlative *tena*. Other relative indeclinables often form similar constructions with correlatives.

For example, we have already seen the construction *yathā...tathā...* ('just as... so...') in the chant on honouring the Buddha with a flower:

*pupphaṃ milāyati yathā idaṃ me*

*kāyo tathā yāti vināsa-bhāvaṃ.*

= Just as this flower of mine withers,  
so the body reaches the condition of destruction.

Other common relative indeclinables include: *yadā* ('when'), *yato* ('because' or 'from where'), and *yadi* ('if'). For example:



*yadā brāhmaṇo kālaṃ karoti, gaccha gāmaṃ.*  
= When the brahmin dies, go to the village.

Sometimes *yadā* has a co-relative such as *tadā* or *atha* ('when... then...') but not always.

Besides such indeclinables as *yattha* ("where"), *yatha* ("as"), *yada* ("when"), *yadi* ("if"), and *yato* ("whence", "because", "since"), certain forms of the relative pronoun have, besides their ordinary uses, uses as indeclinables.

Thus the **neuter forms of the nominative-accusative singular (especially *yaṃ*) are used in the impersonal sense of "that", "what",** covering a wide range of shades of meaning.

*hoti kho so samayo yaṃ... ayaṃ loko vivaṭṭati*  
= there is indeed the (so) time that (i.e. when) ... this world evolves.

Here the relative clause follows the main clause = elevated speech or emphasis of main clause. The main clause has *samayo* as its subject, the subordinate clause *loko*, the subordination of the *loko* clause is indicated by the *yaṃ* with which it begins--the omitted words say "some time, after a long time"

*yaṃ* frequently appears after the expression *ṭhānaṃ etaṃ vijjati*, introducing the statement of what is possible:

*ṭhānaṃ etaṃ vijjati yaṃ, ...*  
= "it is possible that ... "

Here, of course, the *yaṃ* may be regarded as correlative with the demonstrative *etaṃ*.

*yad* is used in close combination with another indeclinable word: the forms *tad* and *yad* of the neuter pronouns are junction forms of *taṃ* and *yaṃ* taken when following words are closely associated with them syntactically (and hence in utterance): *yad idam* (cf. masculine *yo so* with a different demonstrative), "which that", is used as an indeclinable emphatic demonstrative, "that is", "i.e.", "as for example", "as", "such as", "to wit".

The instrumental *yena* used with a verb of motion means "where", "towards" (cf. the instrumental of the way by which). It "governs" the nominative case (Lesson 1). When doubled, it means "wherever":

*yena yena gacchati*  
= wherever he goes.

*yena yena gacchasi, ahaṃ idha tvaṃ āgamayissāmi*

It is often used with the correlative *tena* preceding the verb:

*yena gāmo tena upasaṃkami*  
= he approached the village.

## INTERROGATIVE PRONOUN

The interrogative pronoun has the stem {*kiṃ*} = "who?", "which?", "what?"

	singular			plural		
	masculine	neuter	feminine	masculine	neuter	feminine
nominative	<i>ko</i>	<i>kiṃ</i>	<i>kā</i>	<i>ke</i>	<i>kāni</i>	<i>kā</i>
accusative	<i>kaṃ</i>	<i>kiṃ</i>	<i>kaṃ</i>			
instrumental	<i>kena</i>		<i>kāya</i>	<i>kehi</i>		<i>kāhi</i>
dative	<i>kassa</i> or <i>kissa</i>		<i>kassā</i>	<i>kesaṃ</i>		<i>kāsaṃ</i>
genitive						

Note: the masculine and neuter genitive singular: *kissa*. Otherwise *kiṃ* declines like *yad* and *tad*.

Interrogative pronouns are pronouns which ask questions: e.g. 'who?', 'whose?'

For example:

*kissa* *ayaṃ ajo hoti*  
= Whose is this goat?

Like relative pronouns, interrogative pronouns can act as adjectives:

*kaṃ vihāraṃ agama*  
= Which monastery did you go to?

The neuter singular form *kiṃ* is sometimes used as an indeclinable, simply making the sentence interrogative. It is usually placed at the beginning of the sentence. (= inversion + "?" in English):

*kiṃ saddaṃ assosi*  
= Did he hear the noise?"

*kiṃ bhagavantam passasi*  
= Do you see the Blessed One?"

As a general rule if a sentence contains an interrogative word the whole sentence is interrogative, but a few interrogative sentences contain no interrogative word and must be understood from the context (see the example in [Exercise 9](#)). **Sometimes inversion is used:**

*khamati te idaṃ*  
= Does this please you? / Do you approve of this?

*idaṃ me khamati*  
= This pleases me. / I like this.

There is no equivalent to the question mark in Pali though modern editors sometimes insert question marks in their texts to assist students.

## Pronominal Adjectives

Certain pronouns (sometimes called "pronominal adjectives" because they function as both pronouns and adjectives) follow the declension of *ya(d)* and must be carefully distinguished from adjectives on account of the difference of inflection in the nominative and genitive-dative plural masculine.

Thus, from *sabba* = all  
nominative singular *sabbo* (M.),  
nominative singular *sabbaṃ* (N.: only form),  
nominative singular *sabbā* (F.);  
nominative and accusative plural masculine *sabbe*, like *ye* and unlike *kusalā* (masculine nominative plural), *kusale* (masculine accusative plural);  
genitive and dative plural masculine *sabbesaṃ* (cf. *yesaṃ*, *kusalānaṃ*).

Similar pronouns are:

Pronoun	Meaning
<i>añña</i>	other aññe gāmaṃ agamaṃsu = The others went to the village.
<i>aññatara</i>	a certain, a
<i>apara</i>	another
<i>para</i>	other, another
<i>sabba</i>	all, entire

## **namo tassa...**

The following is perhaps the most common chant in Theravāda Buddhism. It is frequently found at the beginning of Pali texts and often begins ritual ceremonies. It is usually recited three times.

*namo tassa bhagavato arahato sammā-sambuddhassa.*

*Namo* is a neuter noun in the singular meaning 'homage' or 'veneration'. We have not come across such neuters yet, but they decline like *manas* (see Sessions 25/26 of Meiland).

The other words are datives.

*Sammā-* is an indeclinable meaning 'perfectly' or 'fully' and is here attached to the past participle *sambuddhassa*, meaning 'awakened'.

The phrase as a whole can be literally translated as:

"Homage to that Blessed One, who is an arahant and who is perfectly awakened."

If one were to translate arahant, then perhaps 'accomplished' would be suitable, or simply 'enlightened'. It literally means 'worthy' and is from the verb  $\sqrt{arh}$ .

## VOCABULARY

### Verbs

Root	Verb	Meaning
<i>ā-kañkh</i>	<i>ākañkhati</i>	he wishes
<i>(k)kham</i>	<i>khamati</i>	it pleases, it suits, he approves, he likes (dative of person)
<i>ni(r)-(k)kam</i>	<i>nikkhamati</i>	he goes out, he leaves
<i>saṃ-ni-pat</i> (to fall)	<i>sannipatanti</i> สันนิบาต	they assemble
<i>upa-ḷas</i> (to exercise an art)	<i>upaḷāseti</i>	he plays, he sounds

### Nouns

noun	meaning
<i>upasamo</i>	calm
<i>janapado</i>	country
<i>Jīvo</i> จีวะ	life-principle, soul
<i>paccantajo</i>	borderer, foreigner
<i>saṅkhadhamo</i> สังข์	conch blower
<i>dassanaṃ</i> ทักษะ	seeing
<i>phalaṃ</i> ผล	fruit

### Adjectives

adjective	meaning
<i>kamañiya</i>	lovely
<i>paccantima</i>	bordering, foreign
<i>madanīya</i> มันทนา	intoxicating
<i>rajanīya</i>	exciting

### Indeclinables

indeclinable	meaning
<i>ajja</i>	to-day
<i>ambho</i>	sir! (not very respectful)
<i>taṃ</i>	then, so, now (accusative of <i>ta(d)</i> used adverbially)
<i>nu</i>	? (enclitic: an interrogative particle reinforcing an interrogative pronoun or combined with another indeclinable to make it interrogative: <i>nanu</i> , "(is) not?"; or by itself = "does?")
<i>yathā</i>	as, how