

primary source. Since knowledge of German is alas uncommon among Buddhologists, one hopes that the contents of the book may become available in English, and that Wille will publish more corrections to the edition of Dutt/Bagchi, on which otherwise scholars are likely to rely. I am not in a position to comment on the accuracy of Wille's transcriptions; but since Göttingen has for some time been the world centre for the study of such MSS one may presumably feel confidence in them.

The work has an unusual postscript, in which Professor Bechert virtually accuses another researcher who worked under him of plagiarising Wille's work. Perhaps I should therefore clarify that when I express the hope that Wille's results will be published in English, I assume that this would be done with full acknowledgement!

RICHARD GOMBRICH

A CONCORDANCE OF BUDDHIST BIRTH STORIES. By LESLIE GREY. pp. xliii, 268. Oxford, The Pali Text Society, 1990. £28.50.

While working as a medical doctor in the American embassy in New Delhi, Dr Grey chanced to treat Giuseppe Tucci. The encounter got him interested in Buddhist stories and led to his compiling this concordance. It includes about eight hundred stories, identified by title and arranged in the body of the book in the order of the Latin alphabet. They are in two sequences: in the first the stories are from the Pāli *Jātaka* book, with their Pāli titles; in the second and shorter, the stories (most of which are not strictly "birth stories") are drawn from *avadāna* literature and have Sanskrit or, in a few cases, English titles. Occasionally Pāli and Sanskrit get mixed; "Iṣiṣṅga" is an unfortunate case, as it affects the alphabetical order.

Since Grey has to draw his material entirely from books in European languages, coverage is uneven. It is not quite confined to India, since there are some stories found only in Chinese sources (recovered mainly from Chavannes, *Cinq cent contes et apologues*). On the other hand, the coverage of Sanskrit *avadāna* literature is confined to the relatively small part of it that has been translated into a European language.

The greatest strength of the book is that it aims to cover visual material no less comprehensively than texts. It will thus be particularly valuable to art historians and others interested in how the stories are illustrated.

Dr Grey disarmingly declares himself a neophyte on the computer (from which he prepared camera-ready copy), and this may account for many of the inaccuracies which a random sampling reveals. He declares his hope that others will enlarge on his work; indeed, he is hoping to produce a second edition himself, and asks for corrections. It is in this spirit that I offer a few critical observations.

In most entries Grey summarises the story, but not when he has found no other references. If he intends a cooperative effort to expand the work, this seems a bad idea; no one is likely to notice a parallel to a story recorded only by its Pāli title.

He sometimes inserts in the summary a comment of his own. These need editing. For instance, under the *Kaṭṭhahāri Jātaka* we read: "King refuses to recognize child conceived at a chance encounter. Mother throws child up in the air as an Act of Truth: if he is not the father – child may be killed... Original theme of *Kālidāsa*." The last remark presumably refers to the *Śakuntalā*, but it is only the first sentence of the summary to which the plot of the play furnishes a parallel; and what is meant by "original"?

Between his summary and the list of references Grey generally gives what he sees as the moral of the story. Sometimes this is in English: "Irreverence (*sic*) of age", "Devoted wife, filandering (*sic*) husband". Other entries are single Pāli or Sanskrit words, for which the reader who does not know

those languages will have to turn back to consult p. iv. There are listed the ten moral perfections (in the Theravādin classification), with English translations, and the ten “unskillful acts” (*akusala kamma*), which by an unfortunate confusion Grey calls “Pātimokkha”. This confusion is compounded by his remarks on the topic in the Introduction, where the bottom line of p. ii is also duplicated at the top of p. iii. I hope that in the next edition he will either leave out the morals (which should be evident, where appropriate, from the summaries) or at least put them all into English.

I do not understand the reason for the “Sequence number” which immediately follows each title both in the body of the book and in the Index. It may have been the compiler’s private code, but what is its use to readers? Moreover, the present form of the index seems rather pointless, since it lists the titles alphabetically just as they are arranged in the body of the book, serving only to integrate the two halves (*jātaka* and *avadāna*), plus a few alternative titles. The list of “codes”, which are the abbreviations used for the references, should be integrated with the bibliography, and the latter carefully checked; for instance, it must always be specified whether the work is an edition or a translation. The placing of Susil Gupta, publisher of a book by “Grunwedel” (*sic*), in Spain is intriguing.

Despite its evident imperfections this book represents much hard work and will already be useful to scholars. It is to be hoped that they will cooperate by providing corrections and new material, so that Dr Grey can produce a much improved edition.

RICHARD GOMBRICH

BODHGAYA: THE SITE OF ENLIGHTENMENT. Edited by JANICE LEOSHKO with a foreword by PRATAPADITYA PAL. pp. 155, illus. in col. and bl. and wh. Bombay, Marg Publications, 1988

This is a beautifully produced Marg volume, edited by Janice Leoshko, Associate Curator of Indian Art, County of Los Angeles Museum, and intended, according to the Museum’s Indian Art Curator, Pratapaditya Pal, to make Indians more aware of Bodhgaya’s historical importance and influence in the Buddhist world.

The events surrounding the Buddha’s enlightenment commemorated at Mahabodhi shrine at Bodhgaya are central to the Buddha’s teaching and also to every Buddhist’s pursuit of the Middle Way. As Leoshko points out, the most familiar iconographic gesture in Buddhist sculptural history is the *bhumisparśa-mudrā* – that of the seated Buddha with one hand touching the ground, calling earth to witness his overcoming the temptations of Māra. Even today Bodhgaya hosts a number of foreign Buddhist shrines with resident priests and monks, and facilities for pilgrims.

Here the history of the art and architecture is examined, in a general way, first Bodhgaya within its own context and then in the broader geographical context of the Buddhism for which it is an influential and important monument. Leoshko contributes the Introduction, The Vajrayāna Buddha and Buddhist Sculptures from Bodhgaya; Geri H. Malandra, The Mahabodhi Temple; Simon Lawson, Votive Objects from Bodhgaya; Frederick M. Asher, Gaya: Monuments of the Pilgrimage Town; Vidya Dehejia, Bodhgaya and Sri Lanka; Robert L. Brown, Bodhgaya and South-east Asia; Mary Shepherd Slusser, Bodhgaya and Nepal, and Jane Casey Singer, Bodhgaya and Tibet.

While there is no question of the extent of the influence of Bodhgaya – clearly and beautifully portrayed by these distinguished art historians – whether or not the book fulfils the purpose of enlightening a non-Buddhist Indian audience is questionable. It is possible, too, that a non-Indian general audience would have difficulty understanding the text.

All of the authors are either Westerners or Indians employed in American universities. Their methods of exposition are Western. Their articles are studded with specialised terms, familiar only to other Indian art historians, as well as concepts for which there would be no Indian context. And,