

The above-mentioned Chinese discourse, SA 871, which is parallel to SN 32.1, is one of twelve discourses, namely SA 861-872, that are treated as part of a grouping whose title, *Tian Xiangying* 天相應 “Connected with *Devas/Heavens*” in the *Combined Edition of Sūtra and Śāstra of the Saṃyuktāgama* version, was supplied by the editor, Yinshun.⁷ This Chinese version of *Tian Xiangying* is located in the *Zayin song* (“Causal Condition Section”), SA section (3), which corresponds to the Pāli *Nidāna Vagga*, SN section (2). According to Yinshun, this Chinese *Tian Xiangyin* pertains to *Fo/Rulai suoshuo song* 佛/如來所說誦 (“Section Spoken by the Buddha” Skt. *Buddha-bhāṣita*),⁸ of the *vyākaraṇa-aṅga* (P. *veyyākaraṇa-aṅga*) portion of SA/SN.⁹

There is no clear evidence found in the texts to explain why the SN *saṃyuttas* 29, 30, 31, and 32 (as a group of early Buddhist adaptations of Vedic mythical beliefs about *nāgas*, *supaṇṇas*, *gandhabbas*, and *valāhakas*) should be located in section (3) *Khandha Vagga*. The same issue applies to the extant Chinese SA version of the discourses (i.e. *Tian Xiangying* and other missing discourses nearby) located in section (3) *Zayin song*.

Disagreements on teachings contained in the Pāli SN 29.1 AND SN 30.1-2 and their Chinese parallel EA 27.8

The Pāli *Nāga Saṃyutta* SN 29 and *Supaṇṇa Saṃyutta* SN 30¹⁰ have been translated into English by Woodward (1925) and by Bodhi (2000).¹¹ The Chinese EA 27.8 is a counterpart of both discourses SN 29.1 and SN 30.1-2. EA 27.8 is a very short discourse, which has not previously been

⁷ Yinshun 1983, i 47, 50 in “Za ahan jing bulei zhi zhengbian 雜阿含經部類之整編 [Re-edition of the Grouped Structure of SA]”; iii 531-536; FSA 2, 947-956; Choong 2000, 21, 245.

⁸ Hosoda 1989, 542; Choong 2000, 17, n. 5; Chung 2008, 190. Cf. Mukai 1985, 13, nn. 29, 30.

⁹ Choong 2000, 9-11, 17, 21, 245. *Vyākaraṇa* is one of the three *aṅgas* represented in the structure of SA/SN: *sūtra* (P. *sutta*) “discourse” (short, simple prose), *geya* (*geyya*) “stanza” (verse mixed with prose), and *vyākaraṇa* (*veyyākaraṇa*) “exposition”. These three *aṅgas* are the first three of nine types of early Buddhist text (*navāṅga*) classified according to their style and form. They are regarded by some scholars as historically the earliest ones to have appeared, in sequence, in the formation of the early Buddhist texts. Also, only these first three *aṅgas* are mentioned in MN 122 (*Mahāsuññatā-sutta*): III, 115 (cf. also the Ceylonese/Burmese version) and its Chinese parallel, MA 191: T1, 739c. This suggests the possibility that only these three *aṅgas* existed in the period of Early (or pre-sectarian) Buddhism (cf. Mizuno 1988, 23; Nagasaki 2004, 51-2; Choong 2010).

¹⁰ SN III 1890, 240-249.

¹¹ Woodward 1925, 192-196; Bodhi 2000, 1020-1024.

translated. The following is a full translation of it, which I now provide for comparison:¹²

Thus have I heard.

Once the Buddha was staying in Jetavana, Anāthapiṇḍika's park at Śrāvastī.

At that time the World-Honoured One said to the monks: "There are four types of *garuḍa* (*jinchi niao* 金翅鳥).¹³ What are the four? They are egg-born *garuḍas*, womb-born *garuḍas*, moisture-born *garuḍas*, and transformation/metamorphosis-born *garuḍas*. These are the four types of *garuḍa*. Similarly, monks, there are four types of *nāga* (dragon). What are the four? They are egg-born *nāgas*, womb-born *nāgas*, moisture-born *nāgas*, and transformation-born *nāgas*. These, monks, are the four types of *nāga*.¹⁴

"Monks, you should know [this]: If egg-born *garuḍas* want to eat *nāgas*, then they go up onto the iron-fork tree (*tiecha shu* 鐵叉樹),¹⁵ and throw themselves into the sea. The sea is two hundred and eighty thousand miles wide. Beneath [its surface] there are four types of *nāga* palace, where exist egg-born, womb-born, moisture-born, and transformation-born *nāgas*.¹⁶

"At that time the egg-born *garuḍas* use their large wings to beat the water in two directions [in order] to catch egg-born *nāgas* for food. But if the *nāgas* that they catch are of the womb-born type, then the egg-born *garuḍas* will die. At that time, the [egg-born] *garuḍas* who beat the water [in two directions] in order to catch *nāgas* go back up the iron-fork tree before the water closes in.¹⁷

¹² T2, 646a-b; FEA 2, 697-699.

¹³ See Malalasekera 1983, 755 about *Garuḍā*.

¹⁴ 爾時。世尊告諸比丘。有四種金翅鳥。云何為四。有卵生金翅鳥。有胎生金翅鳥。有濕生金翅鳥。有化生金翅鳥。是四種金翅鳥。如是比丘。有四種龍。云何為四。有卵生龍。有胎生龍。有濕生龍。有化生龍。是謂。比丘。有四種龍。

¹⁵ This is an interesting word, but no corresponding Indian term or story is found.

¹⁶ 比丘當知。若彼卵生金翅鳥欲食龍時。上鐵叉樹上。自投于海。而彼海水縱廣二十八萬里。下有四種龍宮。有卵種龍。有胎種龍。有濕種龍。有化種龍。

¹⁷ 是時。卵種金翅鳥。以大翅搏水兩向。取卵種龍食之。設當向胎種龍者。金翅鳥身

“Monks, you should know [this]: If womb-born *garuḍas* want to eat *nāgas*, then they go up the iron-fork tree, and throw themselves into the sea. The seawater is two hundred and eighty thousand miles wide. They beat the seawater [into two] and dive in order to catch womb-born *nāgas*. If they meet with egg-born *nāgas*, then they can also catch them from the seawater. If they meet with moisture-born *nāgas*, the *garuḍa* flock will die.¹⁸

“Monks, you should know [this]: If moisture-born *garuḍas* want to eat *nāgas*, then they go up the iron-fork tree, and throw themselves into the sea. If they meet with egg-born *nāgas*, womb-born *nāgas*, [or] moisture-born *nāgas*, then they are able to catch them. If they meet with transformation-born *nāgas*, [however], the *garuḍa* flock will die.¹⁹

“Monks, if transformation-born *garuḍas* want to eat *nāgas*, then they go up the iron-fork tree and throw themselves into the sea. The seawater is two hundred and eighty thousand miles wide. They beat the seawater [into two directions in order] to catch egg-born *nāgas*, womb-born *nāgas*, moisture-born *nāgas*, [or] transformation-born *nāgas*. They are able to catch them all, [and] they return to the iron-fork tree just before the seawater closes in.²⁰

“Monks, you should know [this]: If the *nāga* king were to serve the Buddha, then at that time *garuḍas* would be unable to eat [*nāgas*]. Why is that? Because the *Tathāgata* constantly practises four kinds of mind, the *garuḍas* are unable to eat. What are the four kinds? The *Tathāgata* constantly practises loving-kindness, compassion, empathic joy, and equanimity.²¹

即當喪亡。爾時。金翅鳥搏水取龍。水猶未合。還上鐵叉樹上。

¹⁸比丘當知。若胎生金翅鳥欲食龍時。上鐵叉樹上。自投于海。然彼海水縱廣二十八萬里。搏水下至值胎種龍。若值卵生龍者。亦能捉之銜出海水。若值濕生龍者。鳥身即死。

¹⁹比丘當知。若濕生金翅鳥欲食龍時。上鐵叉樹上。自投于海。彼若得卵生龍。胎生龍。濕生龍。皆能捉之。設值化生龍者。鳥身即死。

²⁰若。比丘。化生金翅鳥欲食龍時。上鐵叉樹上。自投于海。然彼海水縱廣二十八萬里。搏水下至值卵種龍。胎種龍。濕種龍。化種龍。皆能捉之。海水未合之頃。還上鐵叉樹上。

²¹比丘當知。若使龍王身事佛者。是時金翅鳥不能食噉。所以然者。如來恒行四等之心。以是故鳥不能食龍。云何為四等。如來恒行慈心。恒行悲心。恒行喜心。恒行護心。

That is to say, monks, the *Tathāgata*, who constantly has the four kinds of mind, is of great power, great strength, and cannot be destroyed. For this reason *garuḍas* are unable to eat *nāgas*. Therefore, monks, you should practise the four kinds of mind. Thus, monks, you should do this practice.”²²

At that time, the monks, having heard what the Buddha had said, were delighted and put it into practice.

In comparison, the Pāli parallels, SN 29.1 and SN 30.1-2 of this Chinese discourse (EA 27.8) mention the same four types (*aṇḍajā*, *jalābujā*, *saṃsedajā*, *opapātikā*), from inferior to superior classes, of *nāgas* and *garuḍas* (called *supaṇṇas* in the Pāli), and that *garuḍas* are only able to carry off (*haranti*) *nāgas* that are of equal or inferior types, but not their superiors. However, only the Chinese version mentions that the “iron-fork tree” is used by *garuḍas* in hunting *nāgas* for food. Also, the reason why the four legendary types of *nāgas* and *garuḍas* are included in the Pāli collections (SN 29 and SN 30) within the Buddhist framework is not clearly revealed.

The Pāli and Chinese versions adapt Indic mythology about the two animal classes: serpent-like beings and birds. Nevertheless, the Chinese version seems to provide a motivation for the inclusion of these two mythical animals in the Buddhist context, by showing the importance of practising the “four kinds of mind”.

Disagreements on teachings contained in the Pāli SN 32.1 and its Chinese parallel, SA 871

For the Pāli *Valāhaka Saṃyutta* (SN 32)²³ there already exist English translations by Woodward (1925) and by Bodhi (2000).²⁴ In this *saṃyutta* (SN 32.1-57) only one *sutta*, SN 32.1, has a Chinese counterpart, namely SA 871 (in *Tian Xiangying*, “Connected with Devas”). It is a very short discourse, and has not previously been translated into English. For the purpose of comparison I now provide the following full translation of the Chinese text:²⁵

²² 是謂。比丘。如來恒有此四等心。有大筋力。有大勇猛。不可沮壞。以是之故。金翅之鳥不能食龍。是故。諸比丘。當行四等之心。如是。諸比丘。當作是學。

²³ SN III 1890, 254-257.

²⁴ Woodward 1925, 200-201; Bodhi 2000, 1028-1030.

²⁵ T2, 220b; CSA iii 535; FSA 2, 954-955.