

The SA counterpart, SA 291,¹³⁴ has almost the same general meaning, but with some differences in wording, as follows:

<i>arising mode</i>		<i>ceasing mode</i>	
SN	SA	SN	SA
permanent	permanent	impermanent	disease
happy	eternal	suffering	swelling
self	peace-and-comfort	not-self	arrow
health	health	disease	lethal/pain
safety	self	fear	impermanent
	belonging to self ¹³⁵		suffering
			empty
			not-self ¹³⁶

Here the terms “happy, health, safety, peace-and-comfort” and “disease, fear, swelling, arrow, lethal” are expressions for “not suffering” and “suffering” respectively. “Eternal” in SA is another word for “permanent”. The significant difference between the two versions is that in the ceasing mode SN has “impermanent, suffering, not-self”, whereas SA has “impermanent, suffering, empty, not-self”; the SA version has the extra item *empty*. This is a common situation. We have earlier seen other cases where SA adds *empty* between *suffering* and *not-self*, while SN usually does not.¹³⁷

As regards the causal sequence that results from failing to see *impermanence* etc., the two versions (SN 12. 66 and SA 291) agree in listing three factors: 1. craving (*taṇhā* 愛), 2. basis (*upadhi* 億波提), and 3. suffering (*dukkha* 苦). The term *upadhi* “basis” (rendered phonetically in the Chinese as *yiboti* 億波提) does not appear in the usual twelve-factored formula of *pañiccasamuppāda*. Evidence presented by Bhattacharya indicates that *upadhi* is equivalent to *upādāna* (attachment).¹³⁸ If this is true, then the correspondence between the present listing (three factors) and the above-mentioned series beginning from *craving* to the end of *pañiccasamuppāda* (five factors) is as shown:

134 T 2, p. 82b-c (CSA ii, pp. 20-21). Cf. Tripāṭhī, fragmentary Skt. Sūtra 9, pp. 121-126, which is not entirely the same in structure.

135 常, 恆, 安隱, 無病, 我, 我所.

136 病, 癩, 刺, 殺, 無常, 苦, 空, 非我.

137 See Chapters 2 and 3, pp. 54-55, 92-97.

138 See Kamaleswar BHATTACHARYA, “Upadhi-, Upādi- et Upādāna- dans le Canon Bouddhique Pāli”, *Mélanges d’Indianisme* (à la mémoire de Louis Renou) (E. de Boccard, Paris, 1968), pp. 81-95, especially p. 92.

Causal sequence from craving to the end

three factors	five factors
craving (taṇhā 愛)	craving (taṇhā 愛)
basis (upadhi 億波提)	attachment (upādāna 取)
	becoming (bhava 有)
suffering (dukkha 苦)	birth (jāti 生)
	ageing-and-death (jarāmaṇa 老死)

“Birth, ageing and death” are often equated with “suffering”.¹³⁹ “Becoming” has no exactly corresponding item in the three-factor formula; it may be that its meaning is implied in “basis” (upadhi).¹⁴⁰ Consequently, the two versions of the series beginning from *craving* are not significantly different.

5.8. From ignorance to feeling

SN 12. 19 reports the Buddha as saying:¹⁴¹

For the fool (bāla), bhiksus, covered by *ignorance*, associated with *craving*, this *body* (kāyo) has thus resulted (samudāgato). There is this pair: just this *body* and *externally* (bahiddhā) *name-and-material form* (nāma-rūpam). Conditioned by this pair there is *contact*, just the *six sense spheres* (or the *six contact-sense spheres*).¹⁴² Touched by these, or one of them, the fool *feels* (paṭisamvediyati) *pleasant* and *unpleasant*.

The corresponding SA 294 states:¹⁴³

For the fool, the untaught common person, covered by *ignorance*, associated with *craving*, this *consciousness-body* has resulted (得此識身).¹⁴⁴ *Internally* there is this *consciousness-body* and *externally* there

139 E.g. SN 56. 11: SN v, p. 421.

140 Cf. PED, p. 142.

141 SN ii, pp. 23-24.

142 SN ii, p. 24, note 2.

143 T 2, p. 83c (CSA ii, p. 31). Cf. Tripāthī, Sūtra 12, pp. 140-142.

144 The Skt. has: *sa-vijñānakaḥ kāyaḥ samudāgataḥ*, this body with consciousness ... (Tripāthī, p. 140).